

REMARKS

Applicants request reconsideration and allowance.

Amended claims 1 finds basis in the specification, including page 2, lines 4, 17-18, and page 5.

Amended claim 2 deletes the preferable clause. Amended claims 2-4 include amended preambles.

Amended claim 4 corrects the objection.

Amended claim 10 is in a format consistent with the elected invention.

The amended specification corrects a European numbering (no commas, periods instead) to conventional U.S. format.

A new PTO-1449 type form is attached. It lists the documents previously timely cited, which documents were cited in a foreign search report, which was also disclosed to the Examiner with the IDS of record.

The new claims 13-17 are directed to species within original claim 1.

Claims 1-3 define novel unobvious invention over the Morton et al. reference.

The Morton reference discloses individual flavoring components, none of which has a 2-methyl-3 furyl-thio moiety or a compound of the structure $U-CH_2-S-T$ as defined in the claimed invention.

Some of the Morton's compounds, as rightly remarked by the Examiner, have a structure arguably resembling the structure $U-CH_2-S-T$. However, that resemblance does not go so far as giving the U and T groups claimed in the present invention.

Further, there is nothing in the Morton to suggest the combination of a compound having a 2-methyl-3 furyl-thio moiety with a compound having the structure $U-CH_2-S-T$ with U and T as defined in the claims.

The Morton reference gives flavoring components of the structure $-CH_2S-$ with various flavors, whereas those with a furyl group are directed to a coffee aroma.

There is no incentive in the Morton reference to modify components, let alone components having the structure $\text{-CH}_2\text{S-}$ or the ones with a furyl group to impart or reinforce a meat flavor to any foodstuff.

In that respect, it is well known in the art of flavor that even subtle modifications of chemical compounds having organoleptic properties can lead to drastic modifications of their organoleptic properties. This is well documented in the Morton reference which show various flavoring components with the common structure $\text{-CH}_2\text{S-}$ and various end parts with flavoring ranging from onion to milk. There is no indication whatsoever in the Morton reference as to which modification would be suitable to provide a meat note to any foodstuff.

In addition, there is also no motivation for a person of ordinary skill in the art to make a combination of specific sulfur-containing component which have been modified with the expectation that this would provide a better meat flavor. As demonstrated by Example 10, the combination of such components provides a better meat flavor than a singled out component.

This application is in condition for allowance, subject to re-joinder of non-elected claims. A Notice of Allowance is earnestly solicited.

Respectfully submitted,

FITCH, EVEN, TABIN & FLANNERY

By: 

Kendrew H. Colton

Registration No. 30,368

FITCH, EVEN, TABIN & FLANNERY
1801 K Street, NW
Suite 401L
Washington, DC 20006-1201
Telephone: (202) 419-7000
Facsimile: (202) 419-7007